

# CHAPTER I

## INTRODUCTION

### 1.1 Background of the Study

Literature and film are two forms of narrative media with distinct ways of telling stories, but are often interrelated, particularly in the context of adaptation studies. Bordwell and Kristin Thompson explain that film is a visual art form that relies on moving images, sound, and montage to construct a narrative. They emphasize that while film can be adapted from literature, the way a film tells its story is very different from written text because it relies on aspects of cinematography, editing, and visual storytelling (Bordwell & Thompson, 2008). Literature allows the audience to engage in the imagination of the thoughts and emotions experienced by the character through the text. Film presents a more direct and in-depth experience through its visual storytelling and direct sensory impact on the audience.

In recent centuries, a large number of literary works have been adapted into movies, especially novels. According to Luciano Mariani, approximately 30% from 65% of movie adaptations are adapted from novels, and 80% of best sellers are regularly adapted into movies (Mariani, 2024). A wide range of literary works, particularly novels, have been adapted into a movies, such as *Alice in Wonderland* (1865) by Lewis Carroll, *Fight Club* (1996) by Chuck Palahniuk, *Gone Girl* (2012) by Gillian Flynn, *Little Women* (1868) by Louisa May Alcott, *The Silence of the Lambs* (1988) by Thomas Harris, *Crazy Rich Asians* (2013) by Kevin Kwan and many more.

When literary work is connected to a movie adaptation, then it is appropriate to discuss the adaptation theory briefly. One of the leading theorists is Linda Hutcheon, a Canadian academic and literary critic who is renowned in the fields of literary theory and adaptation studies. In her book *A Theory of Adaptation* published in 2006, she wrote that there is a relationship between literary and film, but there may be differences between them as well, which is why we may be able to compare them. Hutcheon (2006, p. 7) also argues that adaptation is repetition, but repetition without replication. Thus, it means repetition in adaptation does not mean just a copy and paste.

Adaptation is a complex process that implicates narrative transformation across different media rather than a comparison between novels and movies. Adapting is not an easy task because it involves various creative and interpretive challenges and considerations. According to Hutcheon (2006), studying and analyzing adaptation is not as easy a task as just comparing a literary work and a movie, but it also owes us to be familiar with its theme parks, historical enactments, and virtual reality experiments. In other words, Hutcheon wants to show that adaptation is a complex process related to the difference between text and film. Therefore, by analyzing adaptation, we must understand the medium first and how each adaptive form provides a new means to the public to experience a story.

Nowadays, there are several movie adaptations which are suitable to be discussed and compared to the original work. One of the famous novels that was adapted into a movie adaptation and a best seller at that time is *Shutter Island* published in 2003, written by a famous American author, Dennis Lehane. Lehane wrote many popular novels such as *Mystic River*, *The Given Day*, *Gone Baby Gone*,

etc. Lehane is known for his writing in the crime, thriller, and mystery genres. He is also known as a writer with a sharp writing style, full of tension, and rich in psychological exploration. Although *Shutter Island* did not win any major awards, but it received much critical acclaim and became a bestseller. Its success led to the novel being adapted into the movie *Shutter Island* (2010), directed by Martin Scorsese, starring Leonardo DiCaprio. This movie received several awards from various institutions, such as; Best Production Design Award for Dante Ferretti by National Board of Review (2010), Best Actor in a Horror or Thriller Film for Leonardo DiCaprio by Teen Choice Awards (2011).

*Shutter Island* is a psychological thriller novel set in 1954. Tells about Teddy Daniels as U.S. Marshall with his partner Chuck Aule who come to a mental hospital on Shutter Island. They are assigned to investigate the disappearance of a patient named Rachel Solando. During their investigation, they discover various oddities and big secrets in that hospital. Teddy is also often haunted by his past traumas, including the death of his wife and his experience of slaughtering many people during World War II. Nevertheless, at the end, it is revealed that Teddy is actually Andrew Laeddis, a patient being treated at that hospital who suffers from severe mental disorders. All the events that occurred evidently were part of a doctor's experiment to help him face the fact that he had killed his mentally ill wife. In sum, in terms of the storyline, the *Shutter Island* novel and its movie adaptation have no differences. However, some alterations had to be made due to the changes in medium that occurred.

Hence, using the *Shutter Island* novel as an object, the writer intends to examine to what extent the novel's adapter made alterations to the plot section. One

of the significant differences between the two mediums is the ending of the plot. In the novel, the ending is more definitive, in which Teddy must undergo a lobotomy according to hospital procedure. Meanwhile, in the movie, the ending is more ambiguous and complex, making it unclear whether Teddy is still delusional or conscious when he chooses to undergo a lobotomy of his own free will. Therefore, the author will analyze whether these changes affect the overall storyline and alter the theme.

Moreover, the writer will also examine the fidelity of *Shutter Island* to the original work and the results will be in the conclusion. In the movie adaptation, intrinsic and extrinsic aspects could be reduced or added depending on the needs of the film. According to Cartmell and Whelehan, “the most important issue in the adaptation of a literary work into a film is the loyalty to the original source - the novel” (1999). In this statement, Fidelity is an important aspect of adapting a work. Besides showcasing the differences and values of each medium, the text is more important than the film. Many commentators have focused on the process of the transference from novel to movie, where often a wellknown work of great literature is adapted for the cinema and expectations about the 'fidelity' of the screen version come to the fore (Whelehan, 1999).

## **1.2 Identification of the Problem**

Adapting literary works to the screen often involves narrative changes to suit the new medium. The adaptation of *Shutter Island* has proven to have several narrative alterations. Although the adaptation maintains the core storyline of the novel, several narrative alterations are necessary to accommodate the new medium. These alterations raise questions such as what changes occurred and how the theme



is constructed due to changes in the plot. Although *Shutter Island* has been examined in several studies, the narrative function of the plot alteration and its impact on thematic construction have not been adequately explored. Using Linda Hutcheon's adaptation theory, the writer will examine how the movie, as a new medium, can re-convey existing narrative.

### 1.3 Review of Previous Studies

In this section, the writer has collected several studies related to this research, and these studies will be used as references for the writer. Despite there are not many significant studies on the adaptation of *Shutter Island* novel, the writer takes more universal research, but it is nevertheless related to the topic.

First, the research entitled *A Study of Film Adaptation in Dennis Lehane's Shutter Island* by Fadly Sholehudin was published by Universitas Islam Negeri Maulana Malik Ibrahim. This research focuses on identifying changes in intrinsic elements such as plot, characters, settings, and theme through Pamusuk Eneste's theory of addition, reduction, and modification. The results of this research found that the filmmaker has modified and reduced the intrinsic elements without changing the theme in the film. Fadly analyzes change through a sequence of events. This research gives insight to the writer because it contributes to the writer's research in terms of examining the narrative. Nonetheless, this research does not specifically discuss the changes in the structural plot in terms of exposition, complication, climax, and resolution. This research also does not examine the functional impact of those changes on the storyline, which could potentially alter how these themes are represented and interpreted. Therefore, the writer's research aims to fill this gap by analyzing plot alterations using Linda Hutcheon's adaptation

theory. This study also examines how these alterations influence the construction and transformation of themes, thus providing a deeper understanding of the adaptation process as a form of narrative transformation, rather than comparing two distinct media.

The second research is *Shutter Island: The Adaptation of a Suspenseful Story* published in 2023 by Fanny Besnard. This study examines the challenges in adapting how elements of suspense are formed in adaptations of narrative works. In this research, Besnard discusses how the strong suspense elements in Dennis Lehane's novel *Shutter Island* are transferred into visual form in Martin Scorsese's movie adaptation. He highlights that cinematic techniques such as camera angles, lighting, sound, and process are employed to generate tension and build a complex psychological atmosphere of the main character. The contribution of this research provides insight to writers in emphasizing the differences in narrative techniques between text and visual media. Therefore, this research differs from the writer's research because this research concentrates on how tension is transformed from novel to film through cinematic techniques by emphasizing atmosphere and visual narrative. In contrast, the author's research focuses on narrative structure, which emphasizes plot and theme using Linda Hutcheon's adaptation theory.

The third research entitled *The Analysis of Plot in Dennis Lehane's Novel Shutter Island* published in 2020 by Karen Nurul Rizki. This thesis analyzes the plot in the novel *Shutter Island* using Freytag's Pyramid theory which aims to identify five stages of plot: exposition, rising action, climax, falling action, and resolution. The purpose of this study is to describe and understand the complex storyline structure in the novel. The results of this study the plot in this novel adds

tension and each stage of the plot contributes to the development of the characters and the overall theme. The results of this thesis show that Freytag's Pyramid is very relevant to analyzing plot development because it provides a clear picture of narrative management. Although Rizki provides a deep understanding of the plot structure, this research only examines the plot from the novel. Hence, it is going to be different from the writer's research because the writer's research focuses on the alteration and transformation in the novel and movie adaptation of *Shutter Island*. The contribution of this research to the writer's research is this research provides insight in terms of examining the plot of the novel.

Next, the article entitled *Spatial Narration and Psychotherapy in Suspense Novels: Taking 'Shutter Island' as an Example* published in 2024 by Shiqi Wang. This article analyzes the narrative techniques in Dennis Lehane's novel *Shutter Island* using Henri Lefebvre's spatial theory. This study discusses three dimensions: spatial practice, spatial representation, and representational space, to explain the spatial narrative in the text and reflect the psychological transformation of the characters. This paper indicates that the use of spatial theory is key to understanding the psychological aspects of the story, and this spatial theory could interpret the complex and psychologically tense narrative in the novel. This research contributes to the writer's research by providing a complementary conceptual framework for understanding the relationship between narrative space and theme, which can be used to enrich the research on plot alterations.

Next, the research entitled "A Film Adaptation on Characterization of Main Characters from *The Lauren Kate's Fallen*" by Muhammad Rizal (2017). In this study, the author discusses how the main character in the novel and its film

adaptation. He explores these differences and how the adaptation process of the main character's characterization was carried out. This study uses Linda Hutcheon's adaptation theory, which states that adaptation is a formal entity or product, a process of creation, and a process of acceptance, and adaptation is a type of intertextuality of literary works (Hutcheon, 2006, p 8-9). In the results of this study, Rizal found that adaptation was carried out dramatically, visibly, concisely, and frankly. Rizal also said that the characterization of a work will change when adapted into a film, especially in this study. This research is useful in helping the writer analyze using Linda Hutcheon's theory.

Next, an article by Amar Dutta entitled *The Guide: Adaptation from Novel to Film* published in 2016. This article discusses the process of adapting R.K. Narayan's novel "*The Guide*" into a film titled "*Guide*" directed by Vijay Anand. Dutta highlights that although film adaptations are often considered less faithful than the original work, filmmakers are free to modify the plot to fit the format and appeal to a larger audience. This article also analyzes the changes that occurred in the adaptation process and how these changes contributed to the success of the film. This article contributes to the writer's research because it discusses the narrative transformation from novel to movie.

On another hand, the research entitled *Transpositions and the Functions in Adapting Doa yang Mengancam: Study of Adaptation in Linda Hutcheon's Perspective* published in 2017 by Ariny Rahmawati. In this reseach, Rahmawati examines the film *Doa yang Mengancam* (2008) directed by Hanung Bramantyo which is adapted from a short story with the same title. Rahmawati stated that this study aims to analyze changes in media and context and their function in the film.



By using Linda Hutcheon's adaptation theory, the results of this study are that the changes made are aimed at making the adaptation work differently and have their own characteristics, both in the medium used and in the idea. This thesis contributes to the writer's research because it compares the changed story elements and also uses the Linda Hutcheon's adaptation theory.

Next, a research by Siti Hairun Nufus Yushar in 2018 entitled "*Adaptation of the Novel Peter and Wendy*" (1911). The writer's purpose in this research is to find out the background of the adapter and explain the motives for the adaptation. Therefore, Yushar categorized all the data found from the novel and film. The theory used by Yushar is Linda Hutcheon's adaptation theory to identify the motives behind the adaptation. The results of this study indicate seven financial attractions, five psychological motives and four cultural capitals. This research helps the writer in analyzing using Linda Hutcheon's theory. This research contributes to the writer's research by strengthening the idea that plot alteration is not merely a change in narrative form but has a significant impact on the construction of themes in new media. Thus, this research provides methodological and conceptual support for the writer's research by analyzing the Shutter Island adaptation.

And the last research gathered for reference is an article by Gehan Margoushy (2019) entitled "*Novel to Film Adaptation Analysis of Young Adult Fantasy Novel the Chronicles of Narnia: Prince Caspian*". The main focus of this research is the disciplines, including film adaptation studies, fantasy novels, and young adult fiction. According to the author, this research is a good example of studying literature analysis, especially adaptation studies. The researcher found that according to Hutcheon, the movie is not just a replica of the novel and changes in

the movie could increase its cultural impact on the audience. The researcher successfully explained how to utilize elements of movie adaptation in *The Chronicles of Narnia: Prince Caspian*. This study helps the writer in examining how narrative structure undergoes significant changes when adapted into a movie.

After reviewing these related studies, this research is positioned to offer a different analytical perspective on the movie adaptation of *Shutter Island*, specifically by examining the function of plot alteration in the adaptation process. While previous studies have discussed changes in the narrative elements, but none have specifically analyzed plot alteration and its impact on the theme through Linda Hutcheon's adaptation theory. Therefore, this study seeks to address this gap by emphasizing plot alterations and reconstruction the meaning of themes in movie adaptations.

#### **1.4 Research Question**

Through this research, here are some questions that will help understand the focus of the research:

1. What plot alterations are found in the adaptation of the novel *Shutter Island* (2003)?
2. How do the plot alterations in the movie adaptation of *Shutter Island* affect the thematic construction compared to the novel?

#### **1.5 The Scope of the Research**

This research focuses on identifying the plot alterations in the novel *Shutter Island* (2003) by Dennis Lehane and its movie adaptation. The writer assumes some alterations can be seen in the narrative of the plot. Therefore, the writer limited this research to two discussions. First, to examine how the plot alterations occur in the

novel *Shutter Island* and its movie adaptation and second, to emphasizes how these plot alteration contribute to the construction and transformation of the themes.

### **1.6 The Objective of the Research**

This research has two objectives. The first objective is to find the plot alterations between the novel *Shutter Island* and its movie adaptation and to determine whether the alterations affect the theme of the story. To achieve this goal, the writer will compare the novel and the movie adaptation to show the differences more clearly. The elements that will be compared are the plot narrative of the novel *Shutter Island* and its movie adaptation.

