

CHAPTER I

INTRODUCTION

1.1. Background of the Research

The struggle faced by women is largely generated by the societal system, named patriarchy. Lerner (1987) states patriarchy is the indication and standardization of men's dominance towards women and children in the household and generally the expansion of the dominance of men in society. The domination towards women indubitably takes their freedom. There are six main patriarchal structures that frame a system of patriarchy which are patriarchal form of production that the husbands expropriate women's labor; the relation between patriarchal and wage labor; the patriarchal state; the violence of men; the relations between patriarchal and sexuality; and patriarchal culture (Walby, 1989). The system mostly limits women's rights.

Furthermore, Guo (2019) addresses that feminists believe patriarchy is a social structure where men are the primary authorities, controlling the property, playing important roles in moral authority and political leadership, and having authority over women and children in domestic establishments. This structure indirectly restricts not only women but also children from participating in taking control over their ownership, freedom, and career which happened to women. Female subjection arises as the keystone in Victorian literature, from the hysterical and mentally disabled female images to the portrayals of young women who have to fight hard to make their voice able to be heard by the patriarchal society of that time (Shabliy et al., 2020). It means women's opinion was considered unimportant in decision-making and perceived as mentally unstable person if they did not fulfill societal expectations.

In the Victorian era, several unwritten rules had been applied for women. Booth (2024) reveals the philosophy of domestic culture which is an anchor of the lives of Victorian women intertwined with the idea of the separate spheres entrenched in the prevailing beliefs about gender roles in the nineteenth-century. Gorham (2013) states in the Victorian period, traditionally, public and private life were considered separate or different spheres which are believed to be inseparably linked with either women or men. The public world of commerce, politics, and professional life was designated as the sphere for men, whereas women's private spheres include love, emotions, and domesticity. Creating a safe haven from the harsh realities of the business world was the moral guardian duty that women played in the Victorian domestic ideal (Gordon & Nair, 2002). Women were demanded to give affection towards men in the house after they worked as moral providers and do the domestic chores. Women's jobs only focused on the household and men dominated the public sphere which expected women to be obedient towards their husband and pictured lower than men.

According to Ingold in Simanjuntak and friends' article (2022), literary work means a type of expression towards traditions and human culture that creates an image of communal life. As in the twentieth century, women's writing explores a scope which each generation of female characters develop into essential and independent existence, disengaged from the traditional limitation of society (Fayzullaeva & Parmonova, 2021). Nevertheless, in literary works, the iconic novels were mostly pioneered by male writers which produce stories focused on the superiority of men. Male writers' viewpoint towards female figures and build the character of women based on the interpretation under the eye of patriarchy rules (Bhola & Pandya, 2024). Feminist theory has argued and centered around the idea that male writers have dominated literature since the dawn of human

civilization, with women's writing being marginalized in popular culture and literature ... along with the patriarchal societal structures and the notion of men's inherent superiority also deterred women from pursuing their literary hope (Raina, 2017). Therefore, in order to establish equitable rights for women, plenty of movements have been organized in the form of texts by women writers: Virginia Woolf, Mary Wollstonecraft, Simone de Beauvoir, Elaine Showalter, and more to unrestrained from patriarchal society.

Buss (2017) defines resistance or it also called as an agency is the way humans express themselves, in consciously and unconsciously processing their life experiences and taking actions towards it. Further, she argues that women's resistance is the action that women have taken to understand their circumstances and fight against the pressure that restricts them to change their way of life, such as patriarchy. The movements that women have made is the way to resist the subjection towards them. In a thesis conducted by Shahid (2017) analyzes the Victorian writers such as Wilkie Collins, Charlotte Brontë, and Anne Brontë had debated the domestic culture by providing their women characters a space to resist the unfairness of society through the medium of attitude, speech, and writing. Shahid argues that writing is a powerful method of resistance for female characters that allows them to express their minds, feelings, and critics towards society, exposing its weaknesses. From the three mediums, writing is the most valuable and becomes the one that persists after the death of the person. The essentials of the texts have been saved on papers and with today's technologies, it can be found on the internet that everyone can access. The texts that are produced by the author will last forever and improve along with time adapting to the developments and issues of the world.

Out of many great women writers, one of them is Nancy Springer. Nancy Springer is one of the American authors that claim herself as a fantasy novel writer. In Smith's article (2004), her full name is Nancy Connor Springer. She was born in 1948 on July 5 in Montclair, New Jersey, United State of America. On her page (Springer, n.d), Springer wrote that she lived with her parents and loved to read in the large library owned by her parents. She grew up as a teenager who cannot express her emotions because her parents would not like it but she is talented in arts and loves to read. She was a hopeless and less romantic person, who married a man that proposed to her after college. She experienced the feeling that it was inappropriate to write because at that moment, as she mentioned on her blog, English literature only examined novels written by male authors. Springer is typically a person who avoided a problem with writing fantasy novels, in order to distract herself from daydreaming and it saved her from depression. In 1996, her husband abandoned Springer while she finally had the sense of herself, realized she was a female, declared her authority as a woman, and no longer a docile waif that he desired. In 2007, *The Case of the Missing Marquess* (2006) was nominated in Edgar Award for Best Juvenile and in 2008 it was nominated in Dorothy Canfield Fisher Children's Book Award. According to Cox (2022) in an interview with Springer, she has won a Carolyn W. Field, an Otherwise Award, a Mythopoeic Fantasy Award, and an Edgar Award over the last 50+ years.

The Enola Holmes Mystery is one of a novel series for young-adult audiences written by Nancy Springer which tells about the forgotten little sister of Sherlock Holmes, Enola. Enola is a girl who lost her mother on her 14th birthday. In order to search for her mother's existence, she escapes to London. In each of the series, Enola is able to solve phenomenal cases before Sherlock. The novel was adapted into a Netflix movie titled

Enola Holmes in 2020 directed by Harry Bradbeer. Before the modern adaptation, Nancy Springer has published six books in the series: *The Case of the Missing Marquess* (2006), *The Case of the Left-Handed Lady* (2007), *The Case of the Bizarre Bouquets* (2008), *The Case of the Peculiar Pink Fan* (2008), *The Case of the Cryptic Crinoline* (2009), and *The Case of the Gypsy Good-Bye or The Case of the Disappearing Duchess* (2010). The first published of all the series was in the United States of America by Philomel Books, an imprint of Penguin Random House LLC. *The Case of Missing Marquess* was reprinted in 2007 by Puffin Books, *The Case of the Left-Handed Lady* in the same publisher was reprinted in 2008, and *The Case of Bizarre Bouquets* was reprinted in 2009.

From the series, the writer found the issues of Victorian women's resistance against patriarchy through three titles which are reprinted by Puffin Books, *The Case of the Missing Marquess* (2007), *The Case of the Left-Handed Lady* (2008), and *The Case of the Bizarre Bouquets* (2009). Therefore, the writer is interested in choosing these three novels because Nancy Springer emphasizes no matter how strong the female character is, the role of male characters is important in the perception of society and shadows every aspect of their life. A critical reading towards these novels is expected to give knowledge to the readers about the Victorian women's resistance and patriarchy in society by showing how women faced the problems as Nancy Springer shows in her novels. This research will generally analyze the patriarchal values of men, society, and explain the way women characters resist patriarchy that is shown in the selected novels of *The Enola Holmes Mystery* series. For that reason, the writer will title the research "Victorian Women's Resistance Against Patriarchy in the Selected Series of *The Enola Holmes Mystery* by Nancy Springer".

1.2. Identification of the Problem

In this research, it analyzes the dominance of men in society and the household as a form of patriarchy that has created unfairness between women and men based on the three novels in the *Enola Holmes* series by Nancy Springer, they are *The Case of the Missing Marquess* (2007), *The Case of the Left-Handed Lady* (2008), and *The Case of the Bizarre Bouquets* (2009). The writer would like to identify the discrepancy between men and women's roles in society, it seems like the dominance power puts portions into the role of men bigger than women. The problem is the author tries to balance the portion between the role of men and women through these three novels in the Victorian era. By presenting Enola Holmes and several female characters, Nancy Springer as the author tries to balance men and women roles in the society. Hence, the writer assumes that this topic should be discussed further.

1.3. Review of Related Studies

In order to enrich the knowledge about women's resistance, the writer reviews previous studies conducted by other researchers that are related to the topic and the novel of the research. Therefore, there are some researchers related to women's resistance in literary work that have been found on the internet.

Sakinah and friends, in their journal article entitled "Characterization of Enola Holmes *The Case of The Missing Marquess*: A Study of Liberal Feminism" (*PHILOLOGY: Journal of English Language and Literature*, vol. 2, no. 1, 2022, pp 20-28). They discussed how the characterization of Enola Holmes by Nancy Springer is different from the other girl teenagers in the nineteenth-century. They revealed Enola's appearance as masculine gender is against the beauty standard in the Victorian era. Her

critical and logical thinking indicates her character as an intelligent woman, also Enola's personality as an independent woman while she escapes from her house to seek her mother and as a sign of rebellion to her brothers. They argued that Enola's characterization has echoed liberal feminism through the decision making in the appearance as her authority to her own body and the action that Enola shows in escaping from patriarchal structures as a rejection to inequality between men and women. Despite their scope of analysis, Sakinah and friends are not mentioning the life of Nancy Springer as a female writer who lives along with the feminist movement. Nevertheless, the article provides a good explanation of the Victorian era that influenced the inequality between men and women.

Putri and Hafsa examined "The Effect of Patriarchy Towards Women's Oppression of Freedom in *Enola Holmes: The Case of the Missing Marquess* by Nancy Springer" (*Prologue: Journal on Language and Literature*, vol. 9, no. 1, 2023, pp. 25-35) in their article. In doing this research, they applied liberal feminism theory by Mary Wollstonecraft. They found out that there are three forms of oppression by patriarchy towards women's freedom in the novel: individual rights, education, and rights to vote. In this research, they also show women's resistance to fight the unfairness between men and women. In individual rights, the female character, Enola, argued and raised her voice in order to deny the choice that was chosen by her brother for her. As in education, the female character shows their quality of knowledge by verbally stating that she had read numerous literary works without attending any schools. Thereupon, in the right to vote, Enola described her mother as a suffragist. It shows that her mother is joining a group which supports the women's movement focused on the rights to vote.

In 2022, in an article by Bahri and friends titled “Feminism in Harry Bradbeer’s *Enola Holmes* (2020)” (*Proceedings of English Linguistics and Literature*, vol. 3, 2022, pp. 20-28), they discuss variative types of feminism in the *Enola Holmes* movie by Harry Bradbeer using Collin’s feminist theory. According to Collin, feminism consists of: liberal feminism, traditional Marxist, radical feminism, socialist feminism, postmodern feminism, and critical race feminism. In this discussion, they are concerned about gender equality, the oppression of women, and the freedom of women. They reveal that in the movie, there are four forms of feminism, such as liberal feminism, traditional Marxist feminism, radical feminism, and socialist feminism. Liberal feminism is the most established because the characters' actions in the movie show women's oppression in various ways for 65%. Additionally, radical feminism only serves 6% by showing the position of women in society as submissive and men as in control. They also uncover that postmodern and critical race feminism did not arise in the 19th century.

Another research is by Nara Windan Satibi in her thesis entitled “Women’s Resistance Portrayed in Harry Bradbeer’s *Enola Holmes* (2020) Along with The Characterization”. She analyzed women’s resistance issues depicted in the movie using Richard Gill’s characterization theory and power feminism by Naomi Wolf. She found out that Enola has two types of characteristics which are ingenuity and masculine with comfy presence. Along with that, she also shows women’s resistance in the perspective of power feminism in the six forms such as the independence of women, the toughness of women, women’s favoring others before themselves, equal rights for both genders, and women's freedom to create their own life choices. In this research, Satibi managed to merge two distinct theories in order to examine further which is useful for her analysis and enrich my knowledge.

Amalia and Hartono in their journal article titled “Women's Resistance to Marginalization in Oka Rusmini's Novel *Tempurung*: A Study of Feminist Literature” (*International Journal of Linguistics, Literature and Translation*, vol. 6, no. 10, 2023, pp. 104-111). They discussed women’s struggle who faced marginalization and examined the resistance efforts of women surrounded by a patriarchal environment which used feminist literary criticism. They stated that in fighting against marginalization, Oka Rusmini’s characters in *Tempurung* show that women have made resistance efforts such as Saring and Sipleg who are working hard to recover their economic issues as a form to self-defense towards marginalization and free from male domination because their existence is considered in Bali society if they have money. Putu being someone with intellect and bravery to take action to prove herself able to work in public spheres like men does. Saring shows the existence of women by leaving her hometown, she can escape from the bad mouth and power that controlled her in the village. The last effort as Sipleg and Pidagda opposes the Balinese cultural rules. They assume that these resistance efforts are shown in order to prove women can make choices and take action unrestrained from patriarchy chains.

1.4. Research Questions

This research will answer several questions:

1. How are patriarchal values in the selected novels of *The Enola Holmes Mystery* series?
2. How do women characters resist patriarchal values in the selected novels of *The Enola Holmes Mystery* series?

1.5. Scope of the Research

In this research, the issue that concerns the writer is the Victorian women's resistance against patriarchy in the selected series of *Enola Holmes Mystery* by Nancy Springer. The writer will focus on understanding men and societal perspectives towards women which influence women's unique behavior, thoughts and creative expressions to resist the patriarchal system that impacted the role of women depicted in the three novels of the series. By providing the results of the analysis, it would be great for the readers to know about women under patriarchy and women's resistance against it. The goal of this thesis is to make the readers realize that women and men are equal: women can wear anything they desire, women should be able to get public education, women can work as well as men to earn money, and women can freely choose with whom or not to marry anyone. Also, the literary students will be expected to know about the harm of patriarchy and radical feminism to enrich the knowledge related to the topic that is discussed in the novels.

1.6. Objective of the Research

The series focuses on how Enola explores London and searches for her mother. However, the author shows the patriarchal values that are common in the 19th century, especially the Victorian period, from the law in the government, the way Enola's brothers behave and how they view women. Also, through Enola, Nancy Springer shows descriptions about women in society by both of her male and female characters. In Enola's point of view, she as a woman also has the ability to live her life without being shadowed by her brother's title in public, survive alone with her intelligence and solve her problem with the smart brain that she has. This research will generally analyze the patriarchal

values of men, society, and explain the way women characters resist patriarchy that is shown in the selected series of *The Enola Holmes Mystery* novels: *The Case of the Missing Marquess* (2007), *The Case of the Left-Handed Lady* (2008), and *The Case of the Bizarre Bouquets* (2009) by Nancy Springer. This research will pay attention to the Victorian men, society, and women characters that are shown in the novels who portrayed the issues that happened in the Victorian period.

