

# CHAPTER I

## INTRODUCTION

### 1.1 Background of Research

In the 19th century, smoking was common in many cultures; it is often associated with sophistication, relaxation, and portrayal of a particular social status. Tobacco was primarily consumed through pipes and cigars, and it is also considered a symbol of status and sophistication, with tobacco usage prevalent among the upper classes. Smoking in this current era was widespread in many societies worldwide and played a significant role in social and cultural contexts. Each form of tobacco consumption had its social connotations and some degree of rituals. Smoking was popular among men and a symbol of intellectual and scholarly pursuits in the 18th to early 19th century.

The smoking pipe was considered a rather masculine gentleman's accessory; different styles and designs of pipes were crafted to reflect personal taste and social status. Cigar smoking was viewed as a luxurious way of life. It was not until the late 19th century that some medical professionals began to raise concerns about the potential health risks of smoking. In 1881, German physician Hermann Sahli published a study suggesting a link between smoking and lung cancer, and it was met with much skepticism at the time (Goodman, 1993).

Cigars were associated with almost every virtuous thing, ranging from various celebrations, special occasions, and gatherings of the elites. Cigar smokers were often portrayed as prosperous and distinguished individuals in art and literature (Gately, 2001). In the extent of smoking portrayed in the literature,

smoking was a deep and recurring theme in both classical and modern works of art, especially in works of literature.

Smoking has been a recurring theme in literary works, often used to convey various meanings and symbolism. It can represent different aspects such as addiction, rebellion, social status, or self-destructive behavior. Throughout literary history, authors have employed smoking to add depth to characters, create atmosphere, or a particular comment on societal norms. Here are two examples of smoking in literary works. The first work is "*The Great Gatsby*" by F. Scott Fitzgerald. In this classic novel, smoking is depicted as a symbol of sophistication and social status. Characters like Jay Gatsby and Tom Buchanan often smoke, reflecting their wealthy and privileged lifestyles. The act of smoking serves as a marker of their excesses and the superficiality of the Jazz Age society. The second work is "*The Catcher in the Rye*" by J.D. Salinger. Smoking is a recurring motif in this novel, highlighting the rebellious nature and alienation of the protagonist, Holden Caulfield. Smoking becomes an act of defiance against societal norms and a way for Holden to assert his independence and nonconformity.

These examples illustrate smoking in literature as a literary device, adding particular depth to characters and themes and providing social facts. Smoking represents a range of societal norms or personal characteristics. Using smoking as a motif, authors create an image of their characters and convey specific moods and atmospheres within their stories.

A film could undergo a reduction, addition (extension, elaboration), and variation changes in the process. Eneste said that the changes are remarkably regular because there is a particular perception and interpretation from the filmmakers, in this context a scriptwriter, that affects the film production, so production-wise (in the context of film production), the film could be finished. According to Chatman (1990, p. 22), novels are conceptual works; they are discursive (thoughtful, contemplative, imaginative), while film is perceptual and presentational and can be sensed by our visual and auditory sensors. Bluestone (1956) concludes that novels are the media for linguistics, and films are the media for visual.

The word “adaptation” is an attempt to adjust, change, and accordance. Hutcheon explains that adaptation is a broader term than only for novels or films. Adaptation covers the work of short stories, poems, drama, opera, paintings, musical works, dances, and all kinds of other artistic expressions. All of them are open to adapting to other artistic mediums, including digital art and media. Hutcheon’s (2006) view on adaptation emphasizes the creative and transformative nature of the adaptation process. She argues that adaptations should not be seen as inferior reproductions of the original work but as independent artistic creations in their own right. According to Hutcheon, adaptations involve a dialogue between the source material and the adaptation itself, with the adaptation offering a new interpretation and perspective. Hutcheon said intertextuality in adaptations highlights how adaptations often refer to or draw upon other texts, creating a web of connections and references. Adaptations should be analyzed within their specific

cultural and historical contexts, considering how they reflect and engage with the original work and the social, political, and cultural context in which they are produced. Adaptation can also be a form of criticism, enabling re-evaluation and reinterpretation of the source material. Adaptations can shed new light on the original work, offering fresh insights and perspectives that contribute to our understanding of both the adaptation and the source text.

Sir Arthur Conan Doyle (22 May 1859 – 7 July 1930) was a British writer and physician. He is a famous author, and one of his famous fictional works is Detective Sherlock Holmes. Holmes's character was portrayed as a consulting detective with exceptional deductive reasoning and keen observational skills. Holmes was known for his distinctive traits, such as his logical thinking, mastery of disguise, and cocaine addiction (later replaced by his pipe smoking). He began writing Sherlock Holmes in the 19th century (1887) "*A Study in Scarlet*". The story marks the first appearance of Sherlock Holmes and Dr. Watson, who would become the most famous detective duo in literary history.

The book's title derives from a speech given by Holmes, a consulting detective, to his friend and chronicler Watson on the nature of his work, in which he describes the story's murder investigation as his "*A Study in Scarlet*": "There's the scarlet thread of murder running through the colorless skein of life, and we have to unravel it, and isolate it, and expose every inch of it." The story and its main characters attracted little public interest when it first appeared. Only eleven complete copies of the magazine in which the story first appeared, Beeton's Christmas Annual for 1887, are known to exist now and have considerable value.



Although Conan Doyle wrote 56 short stories featuring Holmes, “*A Study in Scarlet*” is one of only four full-length novels in the original canon. The novel was followed by *The Sign of the Four*, published in 1890. *A Study in Scarlet* was the first work of detective fiction to incorporate the magnifying glass as an investigative tool.

Based on the elaboration above, the research object in this writing is seen as a comparison of cultural manifestation in the work of the novel *A Study in Scarlet* by Sir Arthur Conan Doyle. Investigating the correlation between cigarettes and Sherlock Holmes as a representation of the smoking habit is a fresh and progressive research in this context of time, regarding, deductively, there are cultural changes in the outlook on the smoking habit, particularly in Western culture.

## 1.2 Identification of Problem

This thesis's writings focus on the cultural representation of the smoking habit in the authentic text of the novel “*A Study in Scarlet*” and its comparison of today’s smoking perception at the cultural level in BBC’s series Sherlock’s “*A Study in Pink*.” This thesis will bring a significant comparison of the behalf of the cultural shift in smoking perception in the world seen in the authentic work of Sir Arthur Conan Doyle’s novel “*A Study in Scarlet*” (1887) and its film adaptation of BBC’s “*A Study in Pink*” (2010). There is a 113-year gap between the novel and the film. Presumably, we can see depiction and a particular interpretation of habit in the cultural context, looking if there is a shift of perceptions between the original work and the adaptation. Therefore, the writer wants to analyze the difference in depicting smoking habits between the novel and the adaptation regarding the cultural shift.

### 1.3 Review of Related Studies

The first study is a thesis by Giovanny Mario entitled “*A Psychoanalysis and Biographical Analysis on The Main Character as well as the author of Sherlock Holmes: A Study in Scarlet by Sir Arthur Conan Doyle.*” (2013), this thesis examined the psychological aspects of the main characters in the novel “*Sherlock Holmes: A Study in Scarlet*” by Sir Arthur Conan Doyle and to analyze the influence of the author's life on his work. The novel tells the story of a doctor named John Watson who lives with Sherlock Holmes. The theories used in this thesis surround several aspects. First, the “elements of fiction” discuss the fundamental elements within a literary work, such as plot, character, characterization, setting, and point of view. Secondly, the “psychoanalysis” theory is central to this thesis and was developed by an Austrian named Sigmund Freud. The main conclusion is that the main character in this novel has some negative characteristics, such as being selfish, prone to self-infliction, and a perfectionist. Sherlock Holmes is portrayed as a brilliant detective, but at times, to satisfy his curiosity, he does not hesitate to harm himself. For instance, in the early part of the novel, he experiments by drawing blood from his hand. He could have used blood samples from other sources, like animals, but he chose not to. He does not mind getting hurt as long as he can prove himself right through his experiments.

Another conclusion is that the author of the novel has incorporated enough evidence to suggest that the relationship between his personal experiences and the novel's content is quite significant. In real life, the author was a doctor and a literary writer. He writes the novel's story from the first-person perspective of one of its

characters, John Watson. Similarly, Arthur, like Watson, is a doctor and a writer. After solving cases with Holmes, Watson voluntarily agrees to document their joint cases in writing. This similarity in their professions creates a connection between Arthur and Watson. From the various similarities the writer has discovered during the analytical process, it can be said that the novel serves as an expression of Sir Arthur Conan Doyle's personal life.

The following research is entitled "*Traumatic Experiences in Sherlock Holmes: A Study in Scarlet, The Novel.*" (2013), by Awwab M Liko and Robertus Edi Pramono. This study discusses traumatic experiences in the novel *Sherlock Holmes: A Study in Scarlet* by Sir Arthur Conan Doyle. The researcher examines two issues: the causes of Jefferson Hope's traumatic experience and the impact of his traumatic experience. The researcher employs a qualitative method in this study and utilizes the theory of traumatic experiences by Eve B. Carlson and Constance Dalenberg. This theory talks about the elements making the experience traumatic, the factors influencing response to trauma, the response at the time of trauma, the core response, and the secondary response following trauma as the results of the trauma. As a result, the deaths of Jefferson Hope's closest people become the cause of Jefferson Hope's traumatic experience. There are several impacts of Jefferson Hope's traumatic experience, i.e., a sense of guilt, aggression, posttraumatic embitterment disorder (PTED), personality changes, and murder cases.

The next is a study by Errisona Mei and Sandi entitled "*Byronic Hero Qualities of Sherlock Holmes as Depicted in The Novel A Study in Scarlet and Television Series Sherlock: A Study in Pink.*" (2013). The researcher analyses the

Byronic Hero qualities that Sherlock Holmes portrays in the Victorian era (*A Study in Scarlet* novel) and the 21st century (Sherlock BBC TV series *A Study in Pink*). Peter L. Thorslev Jr.'s *The Byronic Hero: Types and Prototypes* (1962) was used as a definitive work on the Byronic Hero qualities. The researcher compares the qualities of the Byronic Hero and the two Sherlocks by finding the differences and similarities in the qualities. In analyzing the data, the Hermeneutics Method was applied to reveal the meaning of the novel and the series. The data for this analysis are taken from the descriptions, utterances, and conversations from the novel and the series related to the topic. The analysis confirms that Victorian and modern Sherlock Holmes are Byronic heroes since they both bear most of the qualities of a Byronic hero. The novel Sherlock Holmes has nine out of fifteen qualities of Byronic Hero; there are: Mysterious and magnetic; High level of intelligence and perception; Antisocial and an outcast; Arrogant, larger than life attitude; Social dominance; Cynical; Cunning; Bipolar tendency, a certain level moodiness; and, Ruthless in his aim. The film Sherlock Holmes has ten out of fifteen qualities, which are: Mysterious and magnetic; High level of intelligence and perception; Antisocial and an outcast; Arrogant, larger than life attitude; Social dominance; Cunning; Ruthless in his aim; Self-destructive behavior; Self-critical and introspective; and, Disrespectful of rank and privilege. What differs between the original Sherlock Holmes and the adapted one concerning Byronic Hero qualities is that the former is cynical and has a certain level of moodiness. Sherlock Holmes does not carry those qualities in the film. Instead, he has three qualities that the novel does not have: self-destructive, self-critical, and disrespectful of rank and privilege. Both



Sherlocks share some qualities in Byronic Hero qualities. They are mysterious and magnetic to those around them, have a high level of intelligence, are antisocial and considered outcasts, carry social, wear a larger-than-life attitude, are cunning, and are ruthless in their aim. The two characters materialized from different periods, eventually bearing some differences and similarities in their qualities. However, they still carry most of the qualities of a Byronic Hero.

Another study is research by Nenden Alifa Syahdazahra entitled “*The Representation of Victorian Women in Sherlock Holmes Stories.*” (2016). This research aims to know the representation of Victorian women's character and their position in Sherlock Holmes stories. The researcher uses descriptive qualitative analysis as the method and representation theory to analyze the position of women characters in Sherlock Holmes stories. The data are obtained from the novel. The writer analyzes the women characters using Stuart Hall's Representation Theory. In this analysis, the writer finds that in Sherlock Holmes stories, women were second class to men. Women in the Victorian era were stagnant and could not find any hope or success when forced into these life-long roles and independence. In other words, women from the upper and middle classes are the focus of Sherlock Holmes stories. Arthur Conan Doyle represents them in Sherlock Holmes stories to advance the perception of the English as the elite and all other cultures from other countries as lesser.

Another Study is a Thesis by Olvi Zulaefah Yusuf entitled “*Deconstructive Analysis of the Main Character in Sherlock Holmes Movie.*” (2017). The researcher is concerned about the Deconstructivist analysis of the main character in the

Sherlock Holmes movie. Two main characters analyzed in this research are Sherlock Holmes as the protagonist and Lord Henry Blackwood as the antagonist. This research uses qualitative research to analyze the characters' characterization to find new meanings. The researcher focuses on character analysis using Jacques Derrida's theory. It also uses the eight kinds of characterization to analyze more deeply. This research finds Sherlock Holmes' characterizations based on the movie, such as he always focuses on a case, he can make a new invention, he is a best friend, and he is a great detective. On the other hand, based on deconstructive analysis, it is found that he is easily stressed, an irresponsible man, a bad friend, arrogant, and underestimates the other. Furthermore, his opposite character, Lord Blackwood, based on the movie, is a murderer and ambitious man. However, the deconstructive analysis identifies some different things, such as that he is faithful to God, an optimist, and a clever man. By showing the contrast between the positive and the negative things, it explains the moral value to people who watch the movie Sherlock Holmes.

The next study was an article by Lisanne Cheizoo entitled "*Why Adaptation Studies Need Fidelity*." (2016). In this article, Lisanne tries to restore the relevance of fidelity in adaptation studies. In recent years, fidelity has been considered too narrow because it only focuses on fidelity to the source text, even though many factors can affect an adaptation, such as the cultural context and creative interpretation of the adaptor. Lisanne argues that the concept of fidelity plays an important role as an analytical tool in understanding adaptation. Structurally, the author not only defends the concept of fidelity but also explains the practical use of

this concept. The author also explained that fidelity can also assess the change in meaning of an adaptation. Lisanne not only defends the concept of fidelity but also explains its weaknesses so that this article has a balanced approach. The author of this article also references various theories and examples of adaptations to support his argument. This makes this article interesting for researchers interested in adaptation studies. However, this article more or less presents a more detailed case study to strengthen its argument. Broadly speaking, this article provides interesting insights into the role of fidelity in adaptation studies. This article raises the relevance of fidelity without getting caught up in conservative arguments that only assess the adaptation of fidelity to the source text. This article can be used for researchers who want to delve deeper into fidelity.

The next related study is an article by Intan Pertiwi and Diah Tyahaya Iman (2021) entitled “*Cinematic Adaptation of Markus Zusak’s Novel, The Book Thief: A Newfangled Perspective on The Nazi War, Anti-Semitism, and Narrative*”. This article aims to analyze the film version of Markus Zusak's novel *The Book Thief* on a qualitative and descriptive level. The authors compare the text as a corpus to Percival's film, delving into cinematic themes and motives. They concentrate on three incentives in the film adaptation: economic enticement, cultural capital, and personal and political motivations. Then, they back up their theory with sequences from the film and secondary evidence. Through *Death or the Narrator*, Zusak's work explores the tragedies and anti-Semitism during the Holocaust. The results of this research argue that Percival's film successfully represents the heart of *The Book Thief*, such as the power of words. They also concluded that the film became a

family film that earned acquisition from Percival's alterations. Percival cuts violent parts so that people of all ages can enjoy the picture. The authors contend that the film emphasizes humanism and strong familial relationships between Germans or between Germans and Jews.

#### **1.4 Research Question**

The writer proposes two questions regarding this research:

1. How does “Sherlock Holmes: *A Study in Scarlet*” novel and its adaptation BBC: Sherlock series portray the smoking habit?
2. What is revealed by the portrayal of smoking in the novel “*A Study in Scarlet*” and its adaptation?

#### **1.5 Scope of the Research**

The writer will discuss “Sherlock Holmes: *A Study in Scarlet*,” a novel by Sir Arthur Conan Doyle, and the BBC adaptation Sherlock. The Research will focus on analyzing and comparing the portrayals of smoking habits in the novel and the BBC adaptation series. This research specifically focuses on Episode 1 of the BBC adaptation, as its narrative closely mirrors that of Arthur Conan Doyle’s *A Study in Scarlet*. This alignment allows the researcher to conduct a more focused and in-depth analysis of both media.

#### **1.6 Objectives of the Research**

This research aims to analyze the representation of smoking habits in the novel *A Study in Scarlet* and the adaptation of BBC Sherlock episode 1: *A Study in Pink* using a fidelity and intertextuality approach. This research also explains how



cultural shifts influenced the depiction of smoking in the BBC adaptation directed by Paul McGuigan.

